

# **Children's Rights and Refugee Law**

Conceptualising Children within the  
Refugee Convention

**Samantha Arnold**

First published 2018  
by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN

and by Routledge  
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

*Illustration*

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

© 2018 Samantha Arnold

The right of Samantha Arnold to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by her in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*Trademark notice:* Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.  
British Library Cataloguing in Publication

*British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Arnold, Samantha, author.

Title: Children's rights and refugee law : conceptualising children within the refugee convention.

Description: Abingdon, Oxon [UK] ; New York : Routledge, 2017. |

Series: Law and migration | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017009513 | ISBN 978-1-351-68357-9 (adobe reader) |

ISBN 978-1-351-68356-2 (epub) | ISBN 978-1-351-68355-5 (mobipocket)

Subjects: LCSH: Refugee children—Legal status, laws, etc. | Children's rights.

| Children—Legal status, laws, etc. | Children (International law) | Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989 November 20)—History. | Refugees—Legal status, laws, etc. | Refugees—Protection—International cooperation. | Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees.

Classification: LCC KZ6530 .A76 2017 | DDC 342.08/3—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017009513>

ISBN: 978-1-138-05271-0 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-16763-3 (ebk)

Typeset in Galliard  
by FiSH Books Ltd, Enfield

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<i>Introduction</i>	1
<i>A dichotomy: children's rights and refugee law</i>	2
<i>A children's rights approach</i>	3
<i>Building upon the 'human rights approach'</i>	4
<i>Invisibility in refugee law</i>	5
<i>Locating children's rights in refugee law: Article 6 and the 'Three Ps Approach'</i>	6
<i>Methodology of analysis</i>	9
<b>2 Children, childhood and refugee law</b>	<b>14</b>
<i>Abstract</i>	14
<i>Introduction</i>	14
<i>Indicators of childhood and being a child and refugee law</i>	16
<i>A paradigm shift: the emergence of childhood</i>	18
<i>The modern children's rights movement</i>	22
<i>The beginning of the Children's Rights Movement</i>	23
<i>Global childhood</i>	25
<i>Conflicts within the paradigm shift: an externalisation of rights, romanticism and the role of the family</i>	27
<i>A conceptualisation of childhood</i>	29
<i>Limitation to the modern conceptualisation of children's rights</i>	30
<i>Conclusions</i>	31
<b>3 International Children's Rights Law</b>	<b>39</b>
<i>Abstract</i>	39
<i>Introduction</i>	39
<i>Origins of children's rights in international law</i>	40

	<i>Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989 and life, survival and development</i>	42
	<i>Provision rights</i>	44
	<i>Health</i>	44
	<i>Standard of living</i>	45
	<i>Education</i>	46
	<i>Non-discrimination</i>	48
	<i>Protection rights</i>	48
	<i>Labour exploitation</i>	49
	<i>Other forms of economic exploitation</i>	51
	<i>Involvement in other illicit trades</i>	51
	<i>Military conscription</i>	51
	<i>Child marriage</i>	52
	<i>Other non-economic forms of harm</i>	53
	<i>Participation rights</i>	54
	<i>Agency in the Convention on the Rights of the Child</i>	54
	<i>Determining agency</i>	56
	<i>Right to be heard</i>	57
	<i>The role of the family in the Convention on the Rights of the Child and provision, protection and participation rights</i>	58
	<i>Children's rights and refugee law – an indirect link?</i>	60
	<i>Conclusions</i>	62
<b>4</b>	<b>Children in the development of refugee law</b>	<b>71</b>
	<i>Abstract</i>	71
	<i>Introduction</i>	71
	<i>Children and the beginnings of international human rights law (pre-1951)</i>	72
	<i>Beginnings of refugee law</i>	74
	<i>The historical trajectory of children in the refugee paradigm</i>	78
	<i>Modern refugee law under the United Nations</i>	80
	<i>Conclusions</i>	83
<b>5</b>	<b>A children's rights approach to refugee law?</b>	<b>90</b>
	<i>Abstract</i>	90
	<i>Introduction</i>	90
	<i>Part I</i>	92
	<i>Context setting</i>	92
	<i>Children within the Refugee Convention and the need for a cross-treaty interpretive approach: some assumptions</i>	94
	<i>Bridging the gap: treaty interpretation</i>	95

<i>The challenge of implementing international law</i>	96
<i>International law as national guidance</i>	98
<i>The object and purpose of the Refugee Convention</i>	99
<i>The object and purpose of the Convention on the Rights of the Child</i>	100
<i>Conclusion on objects and purposes</i>	103
<i>A children's rights approach – justification through UN Guidance</i>	103
<i>United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees</i>	104
<i>Committee on the Rights of the Child</i>	107
<i>Challenges in the interpretation of the Refugee Convention in respect of children's rights</i>	110
<i>Part II</i>	111
<i>A brief introduction to persecution</i>	111
<i>Persecution and children</i>	112
<i>Actors of persecution and protection and the role of the family</i>	115
<i>Children who are not eligible for protection: exclusion</i>	116
<i>Convention grounds</i>	117
<i>Conclusions</i>	123
<b>6 Constructing a children's rights approach: the application of children's rights in refugee law</b>	136
<i>Abstract</i>	136
<i>Introduction</i>	136
<i>Challenges to consistency in the interpretation of child refugee claims</i>	137
<i>Part I</i>	138
<i>Provision rights and refugee protection</i>	138
<i>Family</i>	139
<i>Education</i>	146
<i>Conclusion on provision rights</i>	150
<i>Part II</i>	152
<i>Protection rights and refugee protection</i>	152
<i>Exploitation</i>	153
<i>Labour and trafficking</i>	153
<i>Forced military recruitment and protection of children during conflict</i>	156
<i>Involvement in illicit activities – gangs</i>	157
<i>Other forms of harm: indiscriminate violence and torture</i>	159
<i>Family as persecutor and protector – unattached children</i>	161

## x Contents

<i>Conclusion on protection rights</i>	163
<i>Part III</i>	163
<i>Participation rights and refugee protection</i>	163
<i>Imputed beliefs</i>	165
<i>Religion</i>	166
<i>Political opinion</i>	169
<i>Conclusions: participation rights</i>	172
<i>Conclusions</i>	173
<i>A children's rights approach</i>	176
 7 <b>Conclusions</b>	 191
<i>Abstract</i>	191
<i>Introduction</i>	191
<i>Dichotomies</i>	191
<i>A children's rights framework</i>	192
<i>Invisibility in refugee law</i>	193
<i>A burgeoning children's rights approach to the interpretation     of the Refugee Convention</i>	193
<i>Limited case law</i>	194
<i>A children's rights barometer for persecution: present-day     case law</i>	195
<i>A particular convention ground</i>	196
<i>The findings</i>	197
<i>The questions</i>	198
<i>Moving forward</i>	199
<i>Conclusions</i>	200
 <i>Index</i>	 202